

REPORT

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL MEETING

MEETING DATE: SEPTEMBER 8, 2020

FROM:	Planning Services Department
DATE:	August 26, 2020
SUBJECT:	Removal of Cultural Heritage Landscape Status - 1297 Dundas Street East
LOCATION: WARD:	1297 Dundas Street East 6 Page 1

RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. That the property be removed from any future implementation of the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy; and
- 2. That the property remain on the Oakville Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value as a listed (not designated) property.

KEY FACTS:

The following are key points for consideration with respect to this report:

- The property is listed on the Oakville Heritage Register for historic farmstead known as the Turner Farm.
- Heritage consultants have prepared a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) for the property to assess its cultural heritage value and to determine if the property is considered to be a cultural heritage landscape.
- Based on the CHER, staff are recommending that the property be removed from any future implementation of the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy.
- Staff are also recommending that the property remain on the Oakville Heritage Register as a listed (not designated) property.
- The Heritage Oakville Advisory Committee has been consulted on this matter and supported staff's recommendations.

BACKGROUND:

Provincial Context to Cultural Heritage Landscapes

The Province of Ontario has made a clear commitment to the conservation of significant cultural heritage landscapes through its legislation and policies, including the *Ontario Heritage Act (2005)*, *Planning Act* (1990, as amended), Provincial Policy Statement (2014, updated 2020), and *A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe* (2019).

Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) 2020 relating to Cultural Heritage and Archaeology states:

2.6.1 Significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.

The PPS (2020) defines "significant", in regard to cultural heritage and archaeology, as:

...resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest. Processes and criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest are established by the Province under the authority of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Further, the PPS (2020) and Growth Plan (2019) both define "conserved" as:

the identification, protection, management and use of built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes and archaeological resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained...

The equivalence given to conserving built heritage resources and cultural heritage landscapes in the PPS (2020) is important, as it reinforces the broad scope of the *Ontario Heritage Act* beyond its initial focus on built heritage.

The PPS (2020) definition of a cultural heritage landscape is the following:

"a defined geographical area that may have been modified by human activity and is identified as having cultural heritage value or interest by a community, including an Indigneous community. The area may involve features such as buildings, structures, spaces, views, archaeological sites or natural elements that are valued together for their interrelationship, meaning or association."

The PPS (2020) and *Growth Plan* (2019) function together with the *Ontario Heritage Act* by the shared principle that cultural heritage resources shall be conserved. The *Ontario Heritage Act* sets out the procedures for evaluating and protecting heritage resources at the provincial and municipal levels. This includes the use of Ontario Regulation 9/06 as the means for determining if a property has cultural heritage value.

Cultural Heritage Landscapes Strategy

In January 2014, the Town of Oakville endorsed the Cultural Heritage Landscapes Strategy (the Strategy), which set the foundation to identify, inventory and assess candidate cultural heritage landscapes and to conserve significant cultural heritage landscapes. It also developed a formal process for addressing the conservation of cultural heritage landscape resources in the Town of Oakville.

The Strategy is based on best practices in municipal heritage planning and applicable legislation, including the *Planning Act*, Provincial Policy Statement and the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Section One of the Strategy provides an introduction to cultural heritage landscapes and the applicable legislation, including a discussion of the international and national context of cultural heritage landscape conservation. Section Two defines what cultural heritage landscapes are and how to identify and evaluate them. Section Three outlines the legislation and tools that are available to preserve and protect cultural heritage landscapes and Section Four provides the conservation strategies to preserve and commemorate cultural heritage landscapes.

The Strategy is being implemented in three phases: Phase One: Inventory; Phase Two: Research and Assessment; and, Phase Three: Implementation of Protection Measures.

Phases One and Two of the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy

On February 16, 2016, Oakville Town Council endorsed the recommendations of the Phase One inventory and directed that those properties identified as 'high priority' within the inventory proceed immediately to Phase Two: Research and Assessment. The property at 1297 Dundas Street East was included in the 'low priority' category.

Subject Property

The property at 1297 Dundas Street East is listed on the Oakville Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest for its historic farmstead, including the farmhouse, barn and outbuildings. The property was also included in the inventory for the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy for its potential as a cultural heritage landscape. The property is located on the north side of Dundas Street between Eighth Line and Ninth Line. See Appendix A for the Inventory Report completed as part of the town's Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy.

A Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report was completed by heritage consultants at Golder Associates, and is attached as Appendix B. The document was completed for Argo Development Corporation, a potential purchaser of the property at 1297 Dundas Street, with consent from the current property owner. The document was completed in order to assess the property's cultural heritage value and also to determine whether or not the property should be designated as a Cultural Heritage Landscape or if the property should be removed from any future implementation of the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy.

COMMENT/OPTIONS:

The Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (the report) provides a history of the property and surrounding area and assesses the heritage value of the buildings and landscape elements. It also assesses the whole of the farmstead as a potential cultural heritage landscape.

The report states that while individual elements of the property like the historic farmhouse and historic barn remain, many of the attributes of the original farmstead have been removed or are considered to have low integrity.

The report provides a new Ontario Regulation 9/06 evaluation of the property to determine its cultural heritage value. The result of this assessment is that the historic farmhouse and historic barn (not including the aluminum addition) are shown have cultural heritage value; however, the overall cultural heritage landscape does not retain sufficient historic fabric to be considered representative and is not worthy of designation under s.29, Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Therefore, the cultural heritage landscape is not considered 'significant' according to the PPS (2020) and does not require conservation. Staff therefore recommend that the property be removed from further implementation of the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy.

It is recommended that the property remain on the Oakville Heritage Register as a listed heritage property for the historic farmhouse and historic barn only. The potential purchasers plan to come back to the town with a proposal for the heritage farmhouse and barn once they have finalized the purchase of the property. Both staff and the applicants recognize the need for the conservation of the barn and house to retain and protect their cultural heritage value. The details of this conservation strategy for the property are to be proposed at a later date.

A separate report regarding this matter was presented to the Heritage Oakville Advisory Committee on August 18, 2020. The Committee supported the staff recommendations.

CONSIDERATIONS:

- (A) PUBLIC None
- (B) FINANCIAL None

Page 5

(C) IMPACT ON OTHER DEPARTMENTS & USERS None

(D) CORPORATE AND/OR DEPARTMENT STRATEGIC GOALS This report addresses the corporate strategic goal to:

• enhance our cultural environment

• be the most livable town in Canada

(E) COMMUNITY SUSTAINABILITY

This report generally complies with the sustainability objectives of the North Oakville East Secondary Plan.

APPENDICES:

Appendix A – Cultural Heritage Landscape Inventory Report Appendix B – Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report by Golder Associates

Prepared by: Carolyn Van Sligtenhorst, CAHP, MCIP, RPP Heritage Planner

Recommended by: Diane Childs, MCIP, RPP Manager, Policy Planning and Heritage

Submitted by: Mark H. Simeoni, MCIP, RPP Director, Planning Services