

REPORT

Heritage Oakville Advisory Committee

Meeting Date: November 29, 2022

FROM:	Planning Services Department	
DATE:	November 22, 2022	
SUBJECT:	Heritage permit application HP050/22-42.20L 1475 Lakeshore Road East – Relocation of house, demolition of existing structures and wings, and construction of new additions	
LOCATION: WARD:	1475 Lakeshore Road East Ward 3	Page 1

RECOMMENDATION:

- That Heritage Permit Application HP050/22-42.20L for the relocation of the house within the property, the demolition of existing structures and wings, and the construction of new additions at 1475 Lakeshore Road East, as attached in Appendix B to the report dated November 22, 2022 from Planning Services, be approved subject to the following:
 - a. That a Heritage Easement Agreement for the relocation, rehabilitation and restoration of the Griggs House, located at 1475 Lakeshore Road East, be entered into between the town and the owner in keeping with the content of this report, with the Agreement to be in form and content satisfactory to the Town Solicitor and the Director of Planning Services or their designate;
 - b. That the Heritage Easement Agreement be executed in accordance with Executions By-law 2013-057 and be registered on title to the lands on which the Griggs House is located;
 - c. That the Town Solicitor be authorized to discharge the Heritage Easement Agreement from title to the lands on which it is registered, at the expense of the owner, once the requirements in the Heritage Easement Agreement have been fully satisfied to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning Services or their designate; and

2. That this heritage permit expire two years from the date of final approval by Council.

KEY FACTS:

The following are key points for consideration with respect to this report:

- The property is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* by Bylaw 1991-048.
- The proposal is to relocate the c.1828 heritage house within the property, demolish the existing accessory buildings and house additions, and construct new additions onto the heritage house.
- Staff has reviewed this application and recommends that it be approved subject to the conditions in the recommendation related to the requirement of a Heritage Easement Agreement (HEA).

BACKGROUND:

The property at 1475 Lakeshore Road East is located on the north side of Lakeshore Road East just west of Caulder Drive in southeast Oakville. See Appendix A for the Location Map. The property contains a c.1828 Georgian style home, known as the Griggs House or the Halfway House, that was renovated in the early 20th century in the Neoclassical style. The property is designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* by By-law 1991-048.

A heritage permit application has been submitted for 1475 Lakeshore Road East to complete the following works:

- 1. Relocate the original c.1828 portion of the heritage house south towards Lakeshore Road;
- 2. Demolish the existing accessory buildings and later additions to the heritage house; and
- 3. Construct a new two-storey rear addition and a new one-storey screened-in porch addition onto the heritage house.

The complete heritage permit application was submitted on November 2, 2022. See Appendix B for the application form and drawings of the proposed work. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the 90-day deadline for Council to deal with the application is January 31, 2023.

A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) was completed by heritage consultants Stevens Burgess Architects Ltd. and submitted with the heritage permit application. This document includes an assessment of the cultural heritage value of the property and an assessment of the impact of the proposed alterations on this cultural heritage value. Designation By-law 1991-048 is included in the HIA. The complete document is attached as Appendix C.

In 2016, the property was included in the town's Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy and identified as a medium priority property for its potential as a cultural heritage landscape (CHL). The attached HIA reviewed the property's potential to be a CHL and concluded that while the property still has cultural heritage value for its historic home, the property as a whole does not meet the criteria to be considered a CHL. In November 2022, Council moved to remove the property from the implementation of the Cultural Heritage Landscape Strategy.

COMMENT/OPTIONS:

Cultural heritage value of the property

Around the 1920s, under the ownership or Harry Ryrie, the house was relocated from Lakeshore Road to the north of the property where it is situated now. During this time, the house was renovated to change its original Georgian style to the Neoclassical style that was popular at the time. The exterior alterations included the following:

- The replacement of the wide front verandah with a smaller Neoclassical style front porch;
- The replacement of the simple Georgian entranceway with a new Neoclassical entranceway with transom and sidelites;
- The replacement of the arched 2/2 wood windows with squared 6/6 windows with shutters;
- The removal of the original internal brick chimneys and the construction of a new external stone chimney on the west elevation; and
- The construction of a new two-storey rear addition.

Under the ownership of the Avery family, several structures were added to the property in the 1970s, 1980s and early 2000s. These additions included a one-storey wing on the east side of the 1920s wing, a one-storey sunroom wing on the west side of the house, a detached garage, a pool, a shed and a gazebo.

Designation By-law 1991-048 focuses on the 19th century and early 20th century history of the property and the original c.1828 portion of the house. No mention is made of the later additions to the house, including the 1920s wing. While this wing may have some cultural heritage value, it is not recognized or protected as a designated heritage attribute under this designation by-law. The HIA is consistent with the by-law and recommends that only the original c.1828 portion of the house

be conserved. It further notes that the property is not considered to be a Cultural Heritage Landscape, and no landscape elements are proposed to be conserved.

Relocation of the heritage house

The subject heritage permit application proposes the relocation of the original c.1828 house to the south towards Lakeshore Road, keeping its existing orientation. A site plan showing the existing location of structures and landscaped elements, as well as the proposed location of these features, is included in Appendix B.

The applicants are in the process of determining what options are available to them to sever the property to create new additional lots behind the heritage house. No formal application has been submitted and no approvals have been given for any planning applications on the property related to severance or development. However, the owners are moving forward with this heritage permit application to relocate the house and add new additions in order to confirm that this work would receive heritage support.

Heritage Planning staff are reviewing the subject heritage permit application in the context of there being no planning application to review. The proposed relocation of the heritage house, while a significant change to the building, is not considered to have a significant negative impact on the cultural heritage value of the property. This is in part due to the fact that the house was previously located close to Lakeshore Road and was a commonly known and well-used stagecoach stop and inn. Relocating the house back to Lakeshore Road would allow the house to be more visible from Lakeshore Road and would continue this historical, physical and contextual relationship between the building and this historic road.

If a planning application is submitted for the severance of the property, Heritage Planning staff would provide comments on that application. If the planning application would require changes to the proposal in this heritage permit, the owners would need to receive either minor heritage permit approval from the Director of Planning Services, or major heritage permit approval through the Heritage Oakville Advisory Committee and Council to approve those changes. The approval of this subject heritage permit is not an endorsement or approval of any future planning application on the property.

Demolition of accessory buildings and additions

The application proposes to demolish all existing accessory buildings, landscape structures and additions to the heritage house. These structures include a c.1920s two-storey wing, a 1976 one-storey sunroom wing, a 1980 pool, a 1983 detached garage, a 2002 one-storey wing and a contemporary shed and a gazebo.

These structures are not included as heritage attributes in the designation by-law and have not been identified as having significant cultural heritage value. Staff therefore support their removal. However, it will be required as part of the Heritage Easement Agreement that the applicants salvage historic materials, specifically from the 1920s wing of the house.

Construction of new additions

Once the house is relocated, the owners are proposing to construct a new twostorey addition to the rear of the heritage house and a one-storey screened-in porch to the west of the heritage house. No minor variances are required for the proposed work.

The new two-storey rear addition is a rectangular gable-roofed wing parallel to the heritage house with a gable-roofed hallway connecting the new wing and the old house. The addition has traditional gables referencing those of the heritage house on both side elevations. While the form of the new addition is traditional, the design has a simple and more contemporary aesthetic that allows the more detailed heritage house to remain the focus. The wood board and batten cladding on the new addition is a traditional material that provides texture and softens the contemporary design of the windows and doors.

The new addition includes an integral two-car garage facing the east elevation. The west elevation includes sliding doors and larger windows that face into the property's side yard. The addition also includes a new chimney at the rear. The whole of the wing is to be painted in a darker grey colour to contrast with the white stucco of the heritage house.

The second addition is a one-storey gable-roofed screened-in porch wing on the west elevation of the heritage house set back from the front elevation of the house. The new porch is to have dark grey wood panelling and wood screens on all elevations. The porch will wrap around the existing stone chimney which will remain exposed within the new porch.

Alterations to the existing house

The heritage house is to be restored where needed, including the stucco cladding wood windows, doors, shutters, stone chimney and detailed front porch. On the east elevation of the house, a new 6/6 wood window with shutters is to be installed on the first storey of the house. There is currently no window in this location, though it appears that one likely existed after the 1920s renovations but was removed at a later date, possibly during the 1970s renovations.

On the west elevation, the lower wall is to be restored where the current sunroom was added onto the house. The existing doorway between the house and the sunroom is to be replaced with a new 6/6 wood window with shutters to match the rest of the house. A matching new window is to be installed directly above this first storey window, replacing an existing second storey window to provide symmetry, as the existing window is located directly next to the chimney with insufficient room for shutters. A new doorway will be installed on the first storey of the west wall of the heritage house to access the new screened-in porch just south of the chimney.

Landscaping

The owners intend to update the landscaping on the property but have not yet finalized these details. These will be reviewed through a future heritage permit application.

Heritage assessment

When evaluating the changes to the subject property, staff are guided by Designation By-law 1991-048 as well as the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. This document has also been used by the heritage consultants in the HIA to assess the proposed work. Staff have reviewed the HIA and support the findings and recommendations in this document.

Within the HIA, the heritage consultants have recommended that the following be submitted in order to mitigate any negative impacts on the cultural heritage value of the property:

- o Detailed Move/Relocation Plan for the relocation of the house
- Conservation Plan for the restoration of the front façade
- Rationale for the inclusion of sympathetic materiality that marries the heritage house with its modern addition while still conserving the legibility of the heritage resource
- Commemoration component to acknowledge the history of the Halfway House and its importance for Lakeshore Road East
- Landscape Plan with a landscape strategy that ensures views along Lake Shore Road East are not fully obstructed while still conserving the mature trees and setting

The consultants also recommend that Designation By-law 1991-048 be revised and updated to meet the current requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, including a complete statement of cultural heritage value or interest, a list of heritage attributes and a current legal description.

In order to ensure that all of the proposed work is done properly and that the above mitigation measures have been achieved, it is recommended in the staff recommendation of this report that the owner enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the town for the relocation, rehabilitation and restoration of the Griggs House. As a minimum, the HEA will require the following work to be completed and/or submitted:

- Relocation Plan for the relocation of the heritage house
- Conservation Plan for the rehabilitation and restoration of the house (including final details on materials, etc.)
- Commemoration Plan to commemorate the cultural heritage significance of the property (i.e. plaque)
- Landscape Plan to provide details on what landscape elements are to be retained and how the relocated house and new additions will be situated
- o Salvage Plan for the salvage of historic materials to be removed
- Financial securities to ensure the work is completed
- Approval of an updated designation by-law

Conclusion

The subject proposal is a significant project that has been assessed by both heritage consultants and Heritage Planning staff. The relocation of the heritage house allows for this significant home to be visible to the public while reestablishing its important historical connection to Lakeshore Road East. The c.1828 heritage house is to be retained and its significant heritage attributes restored. Alterations to the heritage house are limited to the sides and rear of the house and are not considered to have a significant impact on the cultural heritage value of the property. The proposed new additions are compatible with the heritage house and also distinguishable from it, allowing the heritage house to retain its prominence on the property.

Staff therefore recommend that this heritage permit application be approved subject to the conditions in the recommendation. The works proposed may be subject to other applicable Town regulations and requirements, such as site alteration permits and building permits. It is the applicant's responsibility to review these matters with applicable staff.

CONSIDERATIONS:

(A) PUBLIC None

(B) FINANCIAL None

(C) IMPACT ON OTHER DEPARTMENTS & USERS

Planning staff will continue working with the Legal Department and Finance Department to carry out the conditions of the heritage permit.

(D) CORPORATE STRATEGIC GOALS

This report addresses the corporate strategic goal(s) to:

- enhance our cultural environment; and,
- be the most livable town in Canada.

(E) CLIMATE CHANGE/ACTION

A Climate Emergency was declared by Council in June 2019 for the purposes of strengthening the Oakville community commitment in reducing carbon footprints. The approval of the subject heritage permit supports the town's climate initiatives through the retention and rehabilitation of the existing home on the property.

APPENDICES:

Appendix A – Location map Appendix B – Heritage permit application Appendix C – Heritage Impact Assessment by Stevens Burgess Architects Ltd.

Prepared by: Carolyn Van Sligtenhorst, MCIP, RPP, CAHP Heritage Planner

Recommended by: Kirk Biggar, MCIP, RPP Manager, Policy Planning and Heritage

Submitted by: Gabe Charles, MCIP, RPP Director, Planning Services