

REPORT

Heritage Oakville Advisory Committee

Meeting Date: September 27, 2022

FROM: Planning Services Department

DATE: September 20, 2022

SUBJECT: Heritage Permit Application HP044/22-42.20R 326 Reynolds Street – Reconstruction of existing garage

LOCATION: 326 Reynolds Street

WARD: Ward 3

Page 1

RECOMMENDATION:

1. That Heritage Permit Application HP044/22-42.20R for the reconstruction of the existing garage at 326 Reynolds Street, as attached in Appendix B to the report dated September 20, 2022 from Planning Services, be approved subject to the following:
 - a. That final details on the windows, doors and cladding material be submitted to Heritage Planning staff for final approval; and
2. That this heritage permit expire two years from the date of final approval by Council.

KEY FACTS:

The following are key points for consideration with respect to this report:

- This property is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as part of the Trafalgar Road Heritage Conservation District.
- The heritage permit application is for the reconstruction of the existing garage.
- Staff has reviewed this application and recommends that it be approved subject to the condition contained in the recommendation.

BACKGROUND:

The property at 326 Reynolds Street is located on the west side of Reynolds Street between Macdonald Road and Lawson Street. See Appendix A for the Location Map. The property contains a two-storey stucco house constructed c.1928 and a one-storey detached garage constructed sometime between 1928 and 1949. The

property is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as part of the Trafalgar Road Heritage Conservation District.

The subject heritage permit application is for the reconstruction of the existing garage with the same design, dimensions and materials. The application form, photos and drawings of the proposed work are attached as Appendix B. Excerpts from the Trafalgar Road Heritage Conservation District Plan have been included as Appendix C.

The complete application was submitted on September 2, 2022. In accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the 90-day deadline for Council to make a decision on the application is December 1, 2022.

COMMENT/OPTIONS:

The subject application proposes to reconstruct the existing one-storey detached stucco-clad garage with a new structure that matches the existing building in design, dimensions and materials.

In April 2021, a heritage permit was approved for a new addition to the rear of the existing historic house, as well as a new addition to the rear of the existing historic garage. The proposal included the retention and restoration of the garage structure.

During the construction phase of this project, considerable structural issues were found with the existing garage. Due to its original construction directly on the ground with no footings or concrete pad, the framing has experienced significant deterioration and has caused the building to lean and bow in areas. In order to restore the structure properly to accommodate the new rear addition, the building would need to be lifted up and placed on new footings and have much of the framing and stucco cladding replaced. There are also areas of rot in the roof structure, which would also need to be replaced.

The applicants are therefore proposing to remove the structure and construct a new garage built as a replica of the existing garage. The new structure would be a frame building with traditional stucco cladding and exposed wood eaves to match those on the existing garage. The previous heritage approval already included the replacement of the existing windows and garage door, which would remain the same in the current proposal. The goal is to build what was previously approved in the 2021 architectural drawings, but with new materials rather than retention of existing ones. The work will also include the new addition to the rear.

When evaluating the changes to the subject property, the District Plan for the Trafalgar Road HCD is the primary policy document to use. Relevant guidelines from the Trafalgar Road HCD Plan have been attached as Appendix C. These

guidelines include the following which relate specifically to alterations to historic structures:

- *Attempt to repair rather than replace.*
- *Base all designs for replacement or restoration of former features on dependable documentary evidence, where available.*
- *When undertaking repairs, replacement or restoration, use the same materials as the original, whenever possible.*
- *New or repair work should not confuse the historic character of an area by creating an impression of greater age or of a different region or even country. Do not obscure signs of age or irregularities found in older work.*

The proposed changes to the house are considered to be in keeping with the guidelines of the District Plan. In most scenarios, property owners of heritage buildings are required to retain the historic structure and restore rather than replace. In some rare circumstances where the feature or structure has deteriorated or has been compromised such that it requires replacement, reconstruction can be supported so long as the new feature matches the original in design and materials. While typically the construction of a replica of a historic building is not required, in this case, the owners would like to retain the appearance of the existing garage and continue with the design in the previously approved proposal.

No minor variances are required for the proposed work.

The subject proposal is therefore considered to be compatible with, and complementary to, the heritage conservation district. Staff recommend that this heritage permit application be approved subject to the condition in the recommendation. The works proposed may be subject to other applicable Town regulations and requirements, such as site alteration permits and building permits. It is the applicant's responsibility to review these matters with applicable staff.

CONSIDERATIONS:

(A) PUBLIC
None

(B) FINANCIAL
None

(C) IMPACT ON OTHER DEPARTMENTS & USERS
None

(D) CORPORATE STRATEGIC GOALS

This report addresses the corporate strategic goal(s) to:

- enhance our cultural environment
- be the most livable town in Canada

(E) CLIMATE CHANGE/ACTION

A Climate Emergency was declared by Council in June 2019 for the purposes of strengthening the Oakville community commitment in reducing greenhouse gas emissions. This report supports the town's climate action by conserving the cultural heritage resource at 326 Reynolds Street.

APPENDICES:

- Appendix A – Location map
- Appendix B – Heritage permit application
- Appendix C – Excerpts from District Plan

Prepared by:

Carolyn Van Sligtenhorst, CAHP, MCIP, RPP
Heritage Planner

Recommended by:

Kirk Biggar, MCIP, RPP
Manager, Policy Planning and Heritage

Submitted by:

Gabe Charles, MCIP, RPP
Director, Planning Services Department